

Corrigendum to “The Brauer group and
the Brauer–Manin set of products of varieties”
J. Eur. Math. Soc. **16** (2014) 749–768.

Alexei N. Skorobogatov and Yuri G. Zarhin

August 30, 2021

Abstract

In his review [F] of our paper [SZ14], Faltings pointed out that he could not follow the proof of Proposition 2.2. In this corrigendum we rectify this and other mistakes in [SZ14].

The main results of [SZ14], Theorems A, B and C, are correct as stated. However, the version of the Künneth formula in degree 2 with coefficients in an arbitrary ring mentioned on p. 750 of [SZ14], with reference to Proposition 2.2, is not true in this generality (see Remark 1.2 for a counterexample). A similar correction needs to be made to Theorem 2.6.

1 Correction to Proposition 2.2

Proposition 1.1 *Let X and Y be non-empty path-connected CW-complexes such that $H_1(X, \mathbb{Z})$ and $H_1(Y, \mathbb{Z})$ are finitely generated abelian groups (which holds when X and Y are finite CW-complexes). For any abelian group G we have a canonical isomorphism*

$$H^1(X \times Y, G) \cong H^1(X, G) \oplus H^1(Y, G).$$

If $G = \mathbb{Z}$ or $G = \mathbb{Z}/n$, where n is a positive integer, then there is a canonical isomorphism

$$H^2(X \times Y, G) \cong H^2(X, G) \oplus H^2(Y, G) \oplus \text{Hom}(H^1(X, G)^\vee, H^1(Y, G)),$$

where for a G -module M we write $M^\vee = \text{Hom}(M, G)$.

Proof. We write $H_n(X) = H_n(X, \mathbb{Z})$. Since X is non-empty and path-connected we have $H_0(X) = \mathbb{Z}$, see [Hat02, Prop. 2.7]. The Künneth formula for homology [Hat02, Thm. 3.B.6] gives a split exact sequence of abelian groups

$$0 \rightarrow \bigoplus_{i=0}^n (H_i(X) \otimes H_{n-i}(Y)) \rightarrow H_n(X \times Y) \rightarrow \bigoplus_{i=0}^{n-1} \text{Tor}(H_i(X), H_{n-1-i}(Y)) \rightarrow 0.$$

Since $H_0(X) = \mathbb{Z}$, in degrees 1 and 2 this gives canonical isomorphisms

$$H_1(X \times Y) \cong H_1(X) \oplus H_1(Y) \quad (1)$$

and

$$H_2(X \times Y) \cong H_2(X) \oplus H_2(Y) \oplus (H_1(X) \otimes H_1(Y)). \quad (2)$$

For any abelian group G , the universal coefficients theorem [Hat02, Thm. 3.2] gives the following (split) exact sequence of abelian groups

$$0 \longrightarrow \text{Ext}(H_{n-1}(X), G) \longrightarrow H^n(X, G) \longrightarrow \text{Hom}(H_n(X), G) \longrightarrow 0, \quad (3)$$

where the third map evaluates a cocycle on a cycle. This gives a canonical isomorphism

$$H^1(X, G) \cong \text{Hom}(H_1(X), G). \quad (4)$$

The desired isomorphism for H^1 now follows from (1).

Using the functoriality of the universal coefficients formula (3) with respect to the projections of $X \times Y$ to X and Y , together with the isomorphisms (1) and (2), we obtain a split short exact sequence

$$0 \rightarrow H^2(X, G) \oplus H^2(Y, G) \rightarrow H^2(X \times Y, G) \rightarrow \text{Hom}(H_1(X) \otimes H_1(Y), G) \rightarrow 0. \quad (5)$$

The second map here has a retraction induced by the embedding of $X \times y_0$ and $x_0 \times Y$, for some base points x_0 and y_0 . The third map in (5) is given by evaluating a cocycle on $X \times Y$ on the product of a cycle on X and a cycle on Y . A similar map with $G = G_1 \otimes G_2$ fits into the following commutative diagram with the natural right-hand vertical map:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} H^2(X \times Y, G_1 \otimes G_2) & \longrightarrow & \text{Hom}(H_1(X) \otimes H_1(Y), G_1 \otimes G_2) \\ \cup \uparrow & & \uparrow \\ H^1(X, G_1) \otimes H^1(Y, G_2) & \xrightarrow{\sim} & \text{Hom}(H_1(X), G_1) \otimes \text{Hom}(H_1(Y), G_2) \end{array} \quad (6)$$

Let $G = \mathbb{Z}$. By assumption, $H_1(X)$ and $H_1(Y)$ are finitely generated abelian groups. Let M and N be their respective quotients by the torsion subgroups. The map induced by multiplication in \mathbb{Z}

$$\text{Hom}(H_1(X), \mathbb{Z}) \otimes \text{Hom}(H_1(Y), \mathbb{Z}) \longrightarrow \text{Hom}(H_1(X) \otimes H_1(Y), \mathbb{Z})$$

coincides with $\text{Hom}(M, \mathbb{Z}) \otimes \text{Hom}(N, \mathbb{Z}) \rightarrow \text{Hom}(M \otimes N, \mathbb{Z})$, which is clearly an isomorphism, so the displayed map is also an isomorphism. Using (4) we rewrite it as

$$H^1(X, \mathbb{Z}) \otimes H^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}) \cong \text{Hom}(H_1(X) \otimes H_1(Y), \mathbb{Z}).$$

Now (5) gives a canonical isomorphism

$$H^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}) \cong H^2(X, \mathbb{Z}) \oplus H^2(Y, \mathbb{Z}) \oplus (H^1(X, \mathbb{Z}) \otimes H^1(Y, \mathbb{Z})). \quad (7)$$

In view of the diagram (6) the last summand is embedded into $H^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z})$ via the cup-product map. Since $H^1(X, \mathbb{Z})$ is a free abelian group of finite rank, we can rewrite (7) and obtain the desired isomorphism for $H^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z})$.

Now let $G = \mathbb{Z}/n$. Then $\text{Hom}(H_1(X) \otimes H_1(Y), \mathbb{Z}/n)$ is canonically isomorphic to

$$\text{Hom}(H_1(X), \text{Hom}(H_1(Y), \mathbb{Z}/n)) \cong \text{Hom}(H_1(X)/n, H^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)).$$

Since $\text{Hom}(H_1(X)/n, \mathbb{Z}/n) \cong H^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)$, we have $H^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)^\vee \cong H_1(X)/n$. Now (5) produces the required isomorphism for $H^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)$. \square

Remark 1.2 For $X = Y = \mathbb{R}\mathbb{P}^2$ we have $H_1(X) = \mathbb{Z}/2$, so in this case the map induced by multiplication in \mathbb{Z}/n with $n = 4$

$$\text{Hom}(H_1(X), \mathbb{Z}/n) \otimes \text{Hom}(H_1(Y), \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow \text{Hom}(H_1(X) \otimes H_1(Y), \mathbb{Z}/n)$$

is zero. From diagram (6) we see that in this case the cup-product map

$$H^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \otimes H^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow H^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)$$

is zero.

2 Correction to Theorem 2.6

Let k be a separably closed field. Let G be a finite commutative group k -scheme of order not divisible by $\text{char}(k)$. The Cartier dual of G is defined as $\widehat{G} = \text{Hom}(G, \mathbb{G}_{m,k})$ in the category of commutative group k -schemes.

For a proper and geometrically integral variety X over k , the natural pairing

$$H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, G) \times \widehat{G} \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{G}_{m,X}) = \text{Pic}(X)$$

gives rise to a canonical isomorphism

$$H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, G) \xrightarrow{\sim} \text{Hom}(\widehat{G}, \text{Pic}(X)). \quad (8)$$

The map in (8) associates to a class of a G -torsor $\mathcal{T} \rightarrow X$ its ‘type’, see [Sko01, Thm. 2.3.6].

Let n be a positive integer not divisible by $\text{char}(k)$. Define S_X as the finite commutative group k -scheme whose Cartier dual is

$$\widehat{S}_X = H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mu_n) \cong \text{Pic}(X)[n]. \quad (9)$$

We shall often consider the Tate twist $\widehat{S}_X(-1)$. So for a finite commutative group k -scheme G such that $nG = 0$ we introduce the notation

$$G^\vee = \text{Hom}(G, \mathbb{Z}/n).$$

In particular, we have $S_X^\vee = H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)$. The pairing $G \times G^\vee \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}/n$ gives rise to a canonical isomorphism $G \xrightarrow{\sim} (G^\vee)^\vee$.

Let $\mathcal{T}_X \rightarrow X$ be an S_X -torsor whose type is the natural inclusion

$$\widehat{S}_X = \text{Pic}(X)[n] \hookrightarrow \text{Pic}(X);$$

it is unique up to isomorphism. The natural pairing

$$H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, S_X) \times S_X^\vee \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)$$

with the class $[\mathcal{T}_X] \in H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, S_X)$ induces the identity map on $S_X^\vee = H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)$. In other words, the image of $[\mathcal{T}_X]$ with respect to the map induced by $a: S_X \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}/n$ equals $a \in S_X^\vee$.

Suppose that Y is also a proper and geometrically integral variety over k . The image of $[\mathcal{T}_X] \otimes [\mathcal{T}_Y]$ under the map

$$H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, S_X) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, S_Y) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)$$

induced by $a: S_X \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}/n$ and $b: S_Y \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}/n$, equals $a \otimes b \in S_X^\vee \otimes S_Y^\vee$.

We refer to [Mil80, Prop. V.1.16] for the existence and properties of the cup-product. Thus we can consider $[\mathcal{T}_X] \cup [\mathcal{T}_Y] \in H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, S_X \otimes S_Y)$ and

$$a \cup b \in H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n \otimes \mathbb{Z}/n) \cong H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n).$$

The cup-product is functorial, so the image of $[\mathcal{T}_X] \cup [\mathcal{T}_Y]$ under the map induced by $a \otimes b$ is $a \cup b$. This can be rephrased by saying that the natural pairing

$$H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, S_X \otimes S_Y) \times S_X^\vee \otimes S_Y^\vee \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \quad (10)$$

with $[\mathcal{T}_X] \cup [\mathcal{T}_Y]$ gives rise to the cup-product map

$$S_X^\vee \otimes S_Y^\vee = H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n).$$

It is important to note that (10) factors through the pairing

$$H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, S_X \otimes S_Y) \times \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n). \quad (11)$$

The pairing (11) with $[\mathcal{T}_X] \cup [\mathcal{T}_Y]$ induces a map

$$\varepsilon: \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n).$$

We thus have a commutative diagram, where ξ is induced by multiplication in \mathbb{Z}/n :

$$\begin{array}{ccc} S_X^\vee \otimes S_Y^\vee & \xrightarrow{\xi} & \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \\ \cong \downarrow & & \downarrow \varepsilon \\ H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) & \xrightarrow{\cup} & H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \end{array} \quad (12)$$

The canonical isomorphism $\mathrm{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \cong \mathrm{Hom}(S_X, S_Y^\vee)$ allows us to rewrite ε as the map sending $\varphi \in \mathrm{Hom}(S_X, S_Y^\vee)$ to $\varepsilon(\varphi) = \varphi_*[\mathcal{T}_X] \cup [\mathcal{T}_Y]$, where \cup stands for the cup-product pairing

$$H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, S_Y^\vee) \times H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, S_Y) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times Y, S_Y^\vee \otimes S_Y) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n).$$

We write $p_X: X \times_k Y \rightarrow X$ and $p_Y: X \times_k Y \rightarrow Y$ for the natural projections. Since X and Y are geometrically integral over the separably closed field k , we can choose base points $x_0 \in X(k)$ and $y_0 \in Y(k)$. We have the induced map

$$(\mathrm{id}_X, y_0)^*: H_{\text{ét}}^i(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^i(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)$$

and a similar map for Y . Using these maps we see that

$$(p_X^*, p_Y^*): H_{\text{ét}}^i(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \oplus H_{\text{ét}}^i(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^i(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \quad (13)$$

is split injective, so we have an isomorphism

$$H_{\text{ét}}^i(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \cong H_{\text{ét}}^i(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \oplus H_{\text{ét}}^i(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \oplus H_{\text{ét}}^i(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)_{\text{prim}}, \quad (14)$$

where $H_{\text{ét}}^i(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)_{\text{prim}}$ is the intersection of kernels of $(\mathrm{id}_X, y_0)^*$ and $(x_0, \mathrm{id}_Y)^*$. Since k is separably closed, we have $H^i(k, M) = 0$ for any abelian group M and any $i \geq 1$. Thus $[\mathcal{T}_X] \cup [\mathcal{T}_Y]$ goes to zero under the maps induced by the restrictions to $x_0 \times Y$ and to $X \times y_0$. This implies that $\mathrm{Im}(\varepsilon) \subset H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)_{\text{prim}}$.

The following is a corrected version of [SZ14, Thm. 2.6].

Theorem 2.1 *Let X and Y be proper and geometrically integral varieties over a separably closed field k . Let n be a positive integer not divisible by $\mathrm{char}(k)$. Then we have the following statements.*

- (i) *Write $H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)^\vee = \mathrm{Hom}(H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n), \mathbb{Z}/n)$ and similarly for Y . The maps ε and ξ defined above fit into the following commutative diagram*

$$\begin{array}{ccc} H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) & \xrightarrow{\xi} & \mathrm{Hom}(H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)^\vee, H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)) \\ \cup \downarrow & & \cong \downarrow \varepsilon \\ H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) & \longleftarrow \longrightarrow & H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)_{\text{prim}} \end{array} \quad (15)$$

where ε is an isomorphism.

- (ii) *If $H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n)$ is a free \mathbb{Z}/n -module (which holds if $\mathrm{NS}(X)[n] = 0$), then ξ is an isomorphism, so we have*

$$H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \cong H_{\text{ét}}^2(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \oplus H_{\text{ét}}^2(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \oplus (H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/n) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)).$$

Proof. Part (ii) is the degree 2 case of [Mil80, Cor. VI.8.13].

Let us prove (i). Diagram (15) is obtained from diagram (12) since $\text{Im}(\varepsilon)$ is a subset of $H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)_{\text{prim}}$, as explained above. It remains to show that ε is an isomorphism. From the spectral sequence

$$E_2^{p,q} = H_{\text{ét}}^p(X, H_{\text{ét}}^q(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)) \Rightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^{p+q}(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)$$

we get an isomorphism $H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)_{\text{prim}} \cong H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n))$. As a particular case of (8) we get an isomorphism

$$H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)) \cong \text{Hom}(S_Y, S_X^\vee) \cong \text{Hom}(S_X, S_Y^\vee).$$

Thus the source and the target of ε are isomorphic finite abelian groups. One can finish the proof following the original arguments in [SZ14] with small adjustments; see [CTS21, pp. 161–162] for this revised proof.

Here we give a short proof communicated to us by Yang Cao. Since the source and the target of ε have the same cardinality, it is enough to show that

$$\varepsilon: \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/n) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/n)_{\text{prim}}$$

is *injective*. More generally, for an integer $m|n$ consider the map

$$\varepsilon_m: \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/m) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/m)_{\text{prim}}$$

defined via pairing with $[\mathcal{T}_X] \cup [\mathcal{T}_Y]$. We prove that ε_m is injective by induction on $m|n$. If p is a prime, the usual Künneth formula [Mil80, Cor. VI.8.13] for the field \mathbb{F}_p implies that the cup-product map

$$\cup: H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{F}_p) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{F}_p) \longrightarrow H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{F}_p)_{\text{prim}}$$

is an isomorphism. We have a commutative diagram

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \text{Hom}(S_X, \mathbb{F}_p) \otimes \text{Hom}(S_Y, \mathbb{F}_p) & \xrightarrow{\xi} & \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{F}_p) \\ \cong \downarrow & & \downarrow \varepsilon_p \\ H_{\text{ét}}^1(X, \mathbb{Z}/p) \otimes H_{\text{ét}}^1(Y, \mathbb{Z}/p) & \xrightarrow{\cup} & H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times_k Y, \mathbb{Z}/p)_{\text{prim}} \end{array} \quad (16)$$

In this case ξ is an isomorphism, hence ε_p is also an isomorphism.

Now for a positive integer $m|n$ assume that ε_a is injective for all $a|m$, $a \neq m$. Write $m = ab$. The exact sequence of abelian groups

$$0 \longrightarrow \mathbb{Z}/a \longrightarrow \mathbb{Z}/m \longrightarrow \mathbb{Z}/b \longrightarrow 0$$

gives rise to the long exact sequences of étale cohomology groups of X , Y and $X \times Y$, which are linked by the split injective maps (13). Using (14) and the well-known fact that $H_{\text{ét}}^1(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/b)_{\text{prim}} = 0$ (see [SZ14, Cor. 1.8] or [CTS21, Thm. 5.7.7 (i)]) we

obtain that the top row of the following commutative diagram is exact (see [CTS21, p. 160] for an alternative argument):

$$\begin{array}{ccccccc}
0 & \longrightarrow & H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/a)_{\text{prim}} & \longrightarrow & H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/m)_{\text{prim}} & \longrightarrow & H_{\text{ét}}^2(X \times Y, \mathbb{Z}/b)_{\text{prim}} \\
& & \uparrow \varepsilon_a & & \uparrow \varepsilon_m & & \uparrow \varepsilon_b \\
0 & \longrightarrow & \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/a) & \longrightarrow & \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/m) & \longrightarrow & \text{Hom}(S_X \otimes S_Y, \mathbb{Z}/b)
\end{array}$$

The bottom row is obviously exact. The diagram implies that the middle map is injective too. We conclude that $\varepsilon = \varepsilon_n$ is injective, hence an isomorphism.

References

- [CTS21] J.-L. Colliot-Thélène and A.N. Skorobogatov. *The Brauer–Grothendieck group*. *Ergebnisse der Mathematik und ihrer Grenzgebiete, 3. Folge, Band 71*, Springer, 2021.
- [F] G. Faltings. Zentralblatt review of [SZ14]. Zbl 1295.14021
- [Hat02] A. Hatcher. *Algebraic topology*. Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- [Mil80] J.S. Milne. *Étale cohomology*. Princeton University Press, 1980.
- [Sko01] A.N. Skorobogatov. *Torsors and rational points*. Cambridge Tracts in Mathematics **144**, Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- [SZ14] A.N. Skorobogatov and Yu.G. Zarhin. The Brauer group and the Brauer–Manin set of products of varieties. *J. Eur. Math. Soc.* **16** (2014) 749–768.